

**MINUTE VOLUME**

**13 December 2023**

**PAGES**

Council	25 October 2023 .....	657 - 664
Cabinet	2 November 2023 .....	665 – 668
Licensing Committee	7 November 2023 .....	669 – 672
Education Committee	9 November 2023 .....	673 – 678
Audit & Scrutiny Committee	23 November 2023 .....	679 – 686
Planning Applications Committee	29 November 2023 .....	687 – 688
Cabinet (Police and Fire)	30 November 2023 .....	689 - 692
Licensing Committee	5 December 2023 .....	693 - 696
Appeals Committee	7 December 2023 .....	697 – 698

BLANK PAGE

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**EAST RENFREWSHIRE COUNCIL**

**Minute of meeting held at 5.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 25 October 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Andrew Anderson	Councillor Jim McLean
Councillor Tony Buchanan (*)	Councillor Colm Merrick (*)
Councillor Kate Campbell	Provost Mary Montague
Councillor Betty Cunningham (*)	Councillor Andrew Morrison
Councillor Danny Devlin	Councillor Owen O'Donnell (Leader)
Councillor Paul Edlin	Councillor Katie Pragnell
Councillor Chris Lunday (*)	Councillor Gordon Wallace (*)
Councillor David Macdonald (*)	

Provost Montague in the Chair

(\*) indicates remote attendance

**Attending:**

Steven Quinn, Chief Executive; Caitriona McAuley, Director of Environment; Julie Murray, Chief Officer, Health and Social Care Partnership; Louise Pringle, Director of Business Operations and Partnerships; Mark Ratter, Director of Education; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Raymond Prior, Head of Children's Services and Criminal Justice; Graeme Smith, Communications Manager; Colin Sweeney, Democratic Services Manager; Linda Hutchison, Senior Committee Services Officer; and John Burke, Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Caroline Bamforth, Angela Convery and Annette Ireland

**INTRODUCTORY REMARKS**

**640.** Provost Montague referred to the following issues:-

(a) **Recent Events in Middle East**

Having referred to the events that had unfolded recently in both Israel and Palestine, Provost Montague commented on the shock shared amongst Elected Members regarding what was happening and the terrible loss of lives. On behalf of the Council, she expressed great sympathy to those who were suffering and offered support to local communities affected by the conflict.

**(b) Former Director of Education - John Wilson**

Provost Montague referred to the recent sad death of John Wilson who, having been a Head of Service within the Education Department, had been the Council's Director of Education from 2002 to 2013. She highlighted his significant impact on improving outcomes for learners, particularly the most vulnerable children and young people; his leadership and ambitions on raising attainment; his passion for inclusion; and his legacy such as on continuous improvement and the use of evidence and data. Having commented on the recognition of his work at a national level, on behalf of the Council, she offered condolences to his family.

**(c) Hindu Festivals**

On behalf of the Council, Provost Montague passed on best wishes to members of the Hindu community who had recently celebrated the festivals of Navratri and Dusshera, adding that she had enjoyed attending a Hindu temple at which she had met inspirational young people who were a credit to themselves and their families.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**641.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**MINUTE OF MEETING OF COUNCIL – 13 SEPTEMBER 2023**

**642.** The Council considered and approved the Minute of the meeting held on 13 September 2023.

**MINUTE OF SPECIAL MEETING OF COUNCIL – 26 SEPTEMBER 2023**

**643.** The Council considered and approved the Minute of the special meeting held on 26 September 2023.

**MINUTES OF MEETINGS OF COMMITTEES**

**644.** The Council considered the Minutes of meetings of the undernoted:-

- (a) Appointments Committee – 12 September 2023;
- (b) Cabinet (Police and Fire) – 14 September 2023;
- (c) Audit and Scrutiny Committee – 26 September 2023;
- (d) Education Committee – 28 September 2023;
- (e) Licensing Committee – 3 October 2023;
- (f) Planning Applications Committee – 4 October 2023;
- (g) Local Review Body – 4 October 2023;
- (h) Cabinet – 5 October 2023; and
- (i) Cabinet – 12 October 2023.

The Minutes were approved, subject to the following amendments to the Minute of the Education Committee meeting of 28 September, namely that on:-

- (i) Page 657, Councillor O'Donnell's name be removed from those present and that his apologies for absence be recorded;
- (ii) Page 658 (Sub-Paragraphs 1 and 3 of Paragraph 610), the references to "Cameron Gibbs" be amended to read "Cameron Gibb";
- (iii) Page 660 (Paragraph 615), the sentence after "(c) Leadership, Empowerment and Improvement" be amended by removing the words "include comments from the Communications Team" and replacing these with "be produced by a graphic design team"; and
- (iv) Page 661 (Paragraph 616), the penultimate paragraph be amended by:-
  - (A) removing the words "...intimated that work had been done on the key words" and replacing these with "...spoke on the engagement that had taken place with key stakeholders"; and
  - (B) removing the words "...and provide further recognition of the work involved." and replacing these with "He also mentioned the self-evaluation framework that had been developed, and included in the Appendix to the report, and that this was being used to strengthen impact."

## **INTERIM TREASURY MANAGEMENT REPORT 2023-24 – QUARTER 1**

**645.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Audit and Scrutiny Committee of 26 September 2023 (Page 642, Item 596 refers), the Council considered a report by the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) on treasury management activities for the first Quarter of 2022-23.

Having heard Councillor Morrison comment on the report, in response to him and Councillor Anderson who referred to the importance of considering the ethics of organisations with which funds were invested by the Council, the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) confirmed that the surplus funds referred to in the report were not invested in long-term investments such as shares. Rather, they were deposited securely on a short-term basis, typically for one to six months, taking account of regularly updated advice provided by the Council's treasury management advisors. The approach taken was amended as required, this being why the Council was asked to approve the list of counterparties quarterly.

The Council approved those organisations specified in the report for the investment of surplus funds.

## **STATEMENTS BY CONVENERS AND REPRESENTATIVES ON JOINT BOARDS AND COMMITTEES**

**646.** The following statements were made:-

(a) **Councillor Pragnell – Convener for Social Work and Health**

Councillor Pragnell summarised matters discussed at the meeting of the Integration Joint Board (IJB) on 27 September, referring first to the approval of the Annual Report and Accounts for 2022/23 and a recommendation made regarding the need for urgent work with partners to develop a sustainable funding position, recognising budget challenges and pressures faced. Despite ongoing work to identify further savings and mitigate cost pressures, the Health and Social Care Partnership (HSCP) remained in a very challenging financial position, with a potential overspend of just over £3m projected due to growing demand and the complexity of services provided. It remained focussed on delivering savings, with £2.4m achieved thus far against a £7m target, the projected overspend further adding to this pressure.

A report on charges for services had proposed increasing these in line with the inflation rate identified by the Council, prior to consideration of these by the Cabinet. A short life working group to support income generation continued to meet, and any further changes proposed would be submitted to the Cabinet.

Reference was made to both the Clinical and Care Governance Annual Report and Chief Social Work Officer's Annual Report discussed by the IJB, both of which demonstrated a significant amount of work being delivered by the HSCP. The IJB had commended ongoing prevention work in light of the pressures faced.

An update had been provided on the National Care Service, including some agreement reached around shared legal responsibility between the Scottish Government and councils, and the fact that a decision remained to be taken on whether or not children services or criminal justice would form part of the Service. The Scottish Government remained committed to delivering the related legislation by the end of the 2026 parliamentary year.

Regarding delayed discharge from hospital, East Renfrewshire ranked 3rd in Scotland for standard delays. However the number of people waiting had increased, with capacity and increasing complexity amongst factors impacting on performance. The number of people requiring two carers continued to increase and there had been delays regarding adults with incapacity.

(b) **Councillor Anderson – Convener for Education, Culture and Leisure**

Councillor Anderson explained that, under the national strategy for public libraries in Scotland, East Renfrewshire libraries worked in partnership with various agencies to deliver on key strategic aims, one of the strongest partnerships being with MacMillan. More specifically he referred to the *Macmillan East Ren* partnership launched in 2019 which provided drop-in face-to-face support and information and also weekly support and information sessions at Barrhead Foundry and Clarkston Library through trained volunteers to help people affected by cancer access support in their local community. Following another successful funding application, the partnership was being extended to 2026, and a recent MacMillan Coffee Morning in Clarkston Library had raised nearly £600 for the charity.

Councillor Anderson commended the Culture and Leisure Trust's Swim Development Team which, for the 2<sup>nd</sup> consecutive year, had been runner up in the Swim Provider of the Year awards run by Scottish Swimming, having again been shortlisted in the top 3 of over 40 public, private and third sector swim providers across Scotland. This reflected significant recent programme growth, with over 1200 new members recruited in the current year and the total programme now exceeding 3000 members for the first time. The Trust had received strong feedback on improvements in developing a very strong and committed workforce invested in delivering the national framework.

Reference was also made to work done with schools to revise a programme focused on water safety which was now cited as a national example, and praise from Scottish Water for the promotion of wider public safety messaging around open water. The Trust's crash course swimming lessons focussed on water safety, complementing the summer holiday free swimming programme and opportunities for care-experienced young people.

Finally, Councillor Anderson highlighted that 23 to 29 October was Care Experience Week which, as in previous years, was an opportunity to celebrate with the area's care experienced young people, their families and those who supported them. The event, again hosted at Eastwood Theatre, encouraged young people to understand their care identity and connect with their peers, and provided a great opportunity to raise awareness of the care experienced community within East Renfrewshire.

The Council noted the statements.

## **PROVOST'S ENGAGEMENTS**

**647.** The Council considered a report by the Director of Business Operations and Partnerships, which provided details of civic engagements attended and civic duties performed by Provost Montague since the meeting of the Council held on 13 September 2023.

Council noted the report.

## **CHIEF SOCIAL WORK OFFICER'S ANNUAL REPORT 2022/23**

**648.** The Council considered the Chief Social Work Officer's (CSWO's) Annual Report for 2022/23, and sought approval of the content for submission to the Office of The Chief Social Work Advisor, Scottish Government.

The Annual Report, a copy which was appended to the report, provided an overview of professional social work activity within East Renfrewshire in 2022/23 through the delivery of statutory functions and responsibilities held by the CSWO. Although there were many examples of success to celebrate and build on, there continued to be significant challenges and risks facing social work and social care, with financial sustainability and uncertainty being core pressures. These challenges could not be met without the continued commitment and dedication of social work and social care staff.

It was highlighted that the experience of many in local communities post pandemic had been challenging, with there being added complications and pressures such as the cost of living crisis. This had involved responding to higher demand for support and increased complexity

in continued unpredictable times. A commitment existed to enabling and supporting vulnerable individuals to make positive, sustainable changes to their lives to achieve the best outcomes for them, their families and communities.

Councillor Pragnell thanked the CSWO for the report which had also been submitted to the most recent IJB meeting, commended the wide range of good work being done, and thanked everyone involved including those involved in partnership work.

The CSWO highlighted key aspects of the report during which he referred to the ongoing and increased demand for services and associated high levels of need and complexity, some of which continued to relate to COVID. He referred to the excellent and sector leading grading awarded following the Care Inspectorate's inspection of services for children and young people at risk of harm, and confirmed that notification of the inspection of adult support and protection had been received during the period covered by the report, the outcome of which had been that the services were regarded as very good. He expressed immense pride in the outcome of both and the services provided for residents. He cited a range of other strengths referred to in the Annual Report, including the support provided for those with mental and emotional well-being needs, victims of domestic abuse and asylum seeking children, and for delivering The Promise. Regarding the Bairns Hoose, the Scottish Government had just confirmed that the service had been successful as part of the North Strathclyde Bairns Hoose partnership in becoming a pathfinder site.

Referring to the unprecedented financial circumstances encountered, the CSWO reported on the need for a voluntary redundancy scheme which would significantly reduce HSCP posts and require restructuring. It was stressed that this would impact on the workforce, the service's greatest strength, who were dedicated to service provision in challenging circumstances. He also referred to the benefits accrued from a range of partnership working.

In response to Councillor Edlin, the CSWO acknowledged the large increase in demand for various services, including in respect of the on-going post pandemic fall out, but expressed hope that needs could be addressed due to the standard, quality and accessibility of services. He cited examples of high referral rates regarding parental mental health and domestic abuse, and confirmed that the challenging financial position faced required the removal of posts and redesign of services to be considered, whilst trying to mitigate against potential risks of changing front-line services, considering child and adult protection risks and supporting the increasing number of children with complex additional support needs. Councillor Edlin highlighted his concerns regarding these enforced cuts and their impact on the community and staff morale.

Having commended the range of excellent work being done referred to in the Annual Report, Councillor Campbell supported by Councillor Wallace expressed concern regarding the increase in referrals regarding peer to peer sexually harmful behaviour, seeking further clarification on the reasons for this. The CSWO referred to the complexity of the different cases, the background to which varied and impacted on the support provided. He expressed confidence in the strong local partnership work done to identify and address such issues, as evidenced through the inspection of this area of work. Also in response to Councillor Campbell, the CSWO outlined the strong work being done to address the needs of those at risk of financial harm, including through targeted provision of information to communities and good partnership working, such as with Trading Standards.

In response to Councillor Morrison regarding resources, the Chief Officer, HSCP confirmed that no further COVID related funding, over and above that already provided, was anticipated from the Scottish Government.

Councillor Buchanan commended the excellent range of work done in challenging circumstances, and welcomed the most recent development regarding the Bairns Hoose.



The Council, having heard Councillor O'Donnell commend the report and outcome of the inspections, approved the Chief Social Work Officer's Annual Report for submission to the Office of The Chief Social Work Advisor, Scottish Government.

## **HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE PARTNERSHIP REVISED INTEGRATION SCHEME - DRAFT FOR CONSULTATION**

**649.** The Council considered a report by the Chief Officer, Health and Social Care Partnership providing an update on work to review the Integration Scheme between East Renfrewshire Council and NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde, and presenting a draft revised Integration Scheme for approval to go out for consultation.

Having summarised the background to the review, the report made reference to review activity and proposed amendments to the Scheme which had been approved initially in June 2015 and amended in 2018 to meet requirements of the Carers (Scotland) Act 2016. The current revision provided a light-touch update and did not result in any changes to the powers and functions of the IJB. The revised draft had been developed in partnership with officers from the other five HSCPs in the Greater Glasgow and Clyde Health board area through a working group, allowing for greater consistency and minimal duplication of effort. The draft revised Scheme would be the subject of a light-touch consultation exercise between October 2023 and January 2024, which would include making it available on the website, sharing it with key partners and engagement with the Strategic Planning Group

The Council:-

- (a) agreed to approve the draft revised Integration Scheme for consultation; and
- (b) otherwise, noted the content of this report.

## **STATUTORY REVIEW OF POLLING SCHEME**

**650.** The Council considered a report by the Director of Business Operations and Partnerships advising the Council of the need to carry out a statutory review of its Polling Scheme, and seeking approval of the draft Polling Scheme for consultation as detailed in Appendix 1 to the report. A copy of the statutory review timetable was also appended to the report.

The report summarised the background to the review, provisions of the Elections Act 2022 and proposed way forward. It was confirmed that the Council required to conduct a review of polling places and polling districts by 2025, and that the review being conducted took into account future population growth, the Council's own development plans and, where possible, the concerns of parents and carers about needing to arrange alternative childcare on polling day. It was clarified that once the final scheme had been approved a further review would not be required until October 2028. Further consideration would be given to any additional comments received and any alternative venues investigated. Responses to the comments made would be included in the next report on the outcome of the consultation submitted to the Council in due course.

The Council:-

- (a) noted the requirements to undertake a Statutory Review of the Polling Scheme between 1 October 2023 and 31 January 2025:

664

- (b) approved the timetable relating to the Statutory Review of the Polling Scheme as outlined in Appendix 2 to the report, and delegated to the Chief Executive authority to make such changes to the timetable as they considered necessary;
- (c) approved for consultation the draft Polling Scheme as referred to in Appendix 1 to the report and authorised the Chief Executive to commence the eight-week consultation on 1 November 2023; and
- (d) noted that a further report would be submitted to the Council on 24 April 2024, or earlier, once the consultation had ended.

## **POST OF HEAD OF PLACE**

**651.** The Council considered a report by the Director of Business Operations and Partnerships, referring to the retirement of the Head of Place with effect from 25 April 2024, proposing arrangements to ensure continuity and stability within the Environment Department if for any reason a successor was not in place by then, and seeking approval of proposals to fill the vacancy through the establishment of a related Appointments Committee.

The Council, having heard the Provost invite nominations for appointment to the Committee:-

- (a) noted the retirement of the Head of Place with effect from 25 April 2024;
- (b) approved the proposed recruitment procedure to fill the vacancy;
- (c) agreed that authority be delegated to the Head of HR & Corporate Services, in consultation with the Director of Environment, to make the necessary arrangements;
- (d) approved the appointment of members to the Appointments Committee as follows:-
  - Provost Mary Montague
  - Councillor Kate Campbell
  - Councillor Chris Lundy
  - Councillor Owen O'Donnell
  - Councillor Katy Pragnell; and
- (e) authorised the Director of Environment to put in place appropriate interim management arrangements for the Department if required.

PROVOST

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**

**Minute of meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 2 November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Owen O'Donnell (Leader)	Councillor Danny Devlin
Councillor Andrew Anderson (Vice Chair)	Councillor Katie Pragnell

Councillor O'Donnell, Leader, in the Chair

**Attending:**

Steven Quinn, Chief Executive; Caitriona McAuley, Director of Environment; Louise Pringle, Director of Business Operations and Partnerships; Lesley Bairden, Head of Finance and Resources (Chief Financial Officer), East Renfrewshire Health and Social Care Partnership; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer)(\*); Phil Daws, Head of Environment (Strategic Services); Julie Breslin, Strategy and Partnership Manager; Paul Parsons, Principal Accountant; John Burke, Committee Services Officer; and Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**652.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**ESTIMATED REVENUE BUDGET OUT-TURN 2023/24**

**653.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) detailing the estimated projected revenue budget out-turn for 2023/24 and providing details of the expected year-end variances together with summary cost information for each of the undernoted services as at 31 August 2023 and subsequent assessment of pressures arising.

- (i) Education Department;
- (ii) Contribution to Integration Joint Board;
- (iii) Environment Department;
- (iv) Environment Department – Support;
- (v) Chief Executive's Office;
- (vi) Chief Executive's Office – Support;
- (vii) Business Operations and Partnerships Department;
- (viii) Business Operations and Partnerships Department – Support;
- (ix) Other Expenditure and Income;
- (x) Joint Boards;
- (xi) Corporate Contingency;
- (xii) Health and Social Care Partnership; and
- (xiii) Housing Revenue Account.

The Chief Accountant advised that on the basis of the information, and taking account of forecast Council Tax collection, a year end operational underspend of £3,037k was forecast on General Fund services. The reasons for departmental variances were set out in the report. She outlined that any such operational underspend at this year-end would assist the Council in meeting future years' budget challenges.

It was noted that the above figures reflected that £6,396k of forecast COVID-related pressures would be covered by drawing on the Council's COVID grant resources and as a result did not impact on the operational budget position.

It was noted that the forecast outturn position could still be subject to significant change, for example if COVID pressures increased again. Conversely, it was hoped that management action to avoid any non-essential expenditure could increase the underspend at year end.

In addition, the report sought approval for a number of service virements and operational budget adjustments, details of which were outlined.

Following a brief discussion, where the improved position in the Council's finances was welcomed by Cabinet members, the Cabinet agreed:-

- (a) to note the forecast underlying General Fund operational underspend of £3,037k together with the HRA operational out-turn in line with budget;
- (b) to note the continued financial pressures on operational services arising from the COVID-19 pandemic and that it was expected to cover those from the COVID grant reserve; and
- (c) to approve service virements and operational adjustments as set out in the notes to the tables in the appendices to the report and note the reported probable out-turn position

## **COVID RESERVE – REVIEW & FINAL PROPOSALS**

**654.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Director of Business Operations and Partnerships on the progress of humanitarian projects that were allocated COVID reserve funding for 2023/2024 and seeking approval for the allocation of the remaining non-recurring COVID recovery reserves.

In speaking to the report, the Strategy and Partnership Manager provided details of a number of the programmes and outcomes achieved by the spending carried out so far, full details of which were provided in Annex 1 of the report.

As there had been an underspend of £244,000 from initial funding allocations, an an additional £1.3m of funding unallocated from the wider COVID grant reserve, proposals to a value of £1.54m were outlined in annex 2 of the report. The Strategy and Partnership Manager gave examples of those projects for Cabinet.

It was highlighted that £687,000 had been earmarked toward Health and Social Care Partnership contingency and support, to assist with the direct and indirect health harms caused by COVID. It was proposed that any uncommitted underspend remaining in the COVID reserves would be allocated to HSCP to assist in-year budget pressures and COVID related impact.

There followed a brief discussion where specific areas of support were discussed. In particular, Councillor Devlin sought clarity around the use of funding to support areas of youth disorder and families in short-stay accommodation. The Head of Environment (Strategic Services) agreed to liaise with the Councillor on the cases he raised.

Thereafter, the Cabinet:-

- (a) noted the progress made toward delivering proposals from the COVID Reserves for humanitarian projects in 2023/2024 set out in Annex 1 to the report;
- (b) approved the final allocation of circa £1.54m of COVID reserves from previous years' Scottish Government funding to support pandemic recovery and renewal as detailed in Annex 2 to the report;
- (c) agreed that any uncommitted underspend remaining in the COVID reserves at year-end 2023/24 be allocated to the Health and Social Care Partnership to assist in-year budget pressures and COVID related impact in the event that HSCP was unable to bring spend back into target;
- (d) delegated to the Director of Business Operations and Partnerships and Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer), in consultation with the Leader of the Council, to exercise flexibility in the terms of the proposals, to ensure most effective use of funding within the spirit of COVID recovery, capacity building and provision of support to the most vulnerable residents; and
- (e) noted that the Head of Environment (Strategic Services) would liaise with Councillor Devlin in terms of his concerns around transport provision to people in homeless accommodation.

## **HRA LAND SALE LOCATED AT SPRINGFIELD ROAD, BARRHEAD**

**655.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Director of Environment on a proposal to vary an existing contract with Ironside Farrar consultants acting for the Council in relation to the sale of land at Springfield Road, Barrhead.

The Council had agreed to the disposal of the land at its meeting on 28 June 2023 (Page 573, Item 520 refers), and Ironside Farrar had been appointed to progress the disposal on behalf of the Council for a fee of £115,250.

The work to progress the disposal had led to additional elements of work, in addition to the original scope, being required. This had been offset against an amount of planned expenditure which had not been spent on consultation with planning case officers, other council departments and statutory consultees, which had been deemed unnecessary.

Additional advice was also required to review the developer's site investigation scope and proposals, which would require additional costs of £9,875 to be considered. Together with the other additional sums required, this brought the commitment to Ironside Farrar to £128,000. In line with Standing Order 14 of the Council's Contract Standing Orders, any variation in contracts for goods and services above £50,000 over 10% of the initial value, would be referred to the Chief Officer – Legal and Procurement for consideration and, if sanctioned by them, must be reported to Cabinet for approval prior to the variation being instructed.

668

As the Chief Officer- Legal and Procurement had sanctioned the variation, it was now being remitted to Cabinet for a final decision.

The report noted that the sum of the £12,750 total variation would be met from the Housing Revenue Account.

Thereafter, the Cabinet approved the request to vary the existing contract with Ironside Farrar in relation to the sale of land at Springfield Road, Barrhead.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LICENSING COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock, on 7 November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Paul Edlin (Chair)  
Provost Mary Montague

Councillor David Macdonald\*

Councillor Edlin in the Chair

(\*) indicates remote attendance

**Attending:**

Gerry Mahon, Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement); Brian Kilpatrick, Civic Government Enforcement Officer; Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer; John Burke, Committee Services Officer; and Lesleyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Chief Inspector Graeme Gallie and Sergeant Lisa Campbell, Police Scotland.

**Apology:**

Councillor Andrew Morrison.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**656.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**CIVIC GOVERNMENT (SCOTLAND) ACT 1982 – McDONALD’S RESTAURANT, BOWERWALLS PLACE, BARRHEAD, GLASGOW G78 1BF – APPLICATION FOR LATE HOURS CATERING LICENCE**

**657.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 5 September 2023 (Page 608, Item 555 refers), when it was agreed that consideration of the application for a Late Hours Catering Licence be deferred until a site visit could take place, the committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement) in relation to an application for the grant of a Late Hours Catering Licence in respect of the McDonald’s Restaurant, Bowerwalls Place, Barrhead (Item 4 refers).

670

The applicant Mr Jim McLean, JE Restaurants Limited, was present together with his Solicitor Mr Scott Flannigan.

Members attended a site visit on 15 September 2023, and they had some additional questions for the applicant prior to a final decision on the application being made. In response to questions, Mr McLean estimated that there may be no more than 20 people in the restaurant between midnight and 5am, with this number reducing to between 5 and 10 people from 2am until 5am. He added that night shift managers were well trained to deal with anti-social behaviour, which included contacting the police if someone was causing a disturbance which they were unable to deal with, or if someone was refusing to vacate the premises when asked to do so. He also spoke about the importance of being a good neighbour and that, if the licence was granted in full but there was a persistent problem, he could decide to close the restaurant during the night to reduce any further disturbance if that was deemed necessary. Thereafter, Sergeant Campbell confirmed that Police Scotland had not objected to the application and that there had been no evidence of increased anti-social behaviour at night in this area.

Mr Mahon provided legal advice to members in relation to the application, advising that, if the applicant was in violation of any of the conditions contained within the licence, it could be revoked by the committee at a later date. Mr Flannigan added that, if the licence was granted, it would be resubmitted for renewal in due course and any issues of concern could be reconsidered at that time.

Following a full discussion, in the course of which Members debated different ways in which the application could be dealt with, Councillor Edlin, seconded by Provost Montague, proposed that the application be granted. Councillor Macdonald proposed as an amendment that the application be refused. As there was no seconder, the amendment fell.

On a vote being taken, Councillor Edlin and Provost Montague voted for the application to be granted and Councillor Macdonald voted for the application to be refused.

The application for a Late Hours Catering Licence was granted for a period of one year, subject to standard conditions.

### **Resolution to Exclude Press and Public**

At this point in the meeting, on the motion of the Chair, the Committee unanimously resolved that in accordance with the provisions of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the remaining items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraphs 6 and 14 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A to the Act.

### **PRIVATE HIRE DRIVER'S LICENCE AND PRIVATE HIRE CAR OPERATOR'S LICENCE – REQUEST FOR IMMEDIATE SUSPENSION**

**658.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Officer – Legal & Procurement in relation to a request for suspension of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence and a Private Hire Car Operator's Licence under Paragraph 11(1) of Schedule 1 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982 (Agenda Item 4 refers). The applicant, having been invited to the meeting, was not present.

Chief Inspector Gallie and Sergeant Campbell representing the Chief Constable, who had requested the suspension, were present. It was reported that the Chief Constable had requested the suspension on the grounds that the licence holder was no longer a fit and proper person to be the holder of these licences, and requested the immediate suspension of the



licences in terms of Paragraph 12(1) of the Schedule on the grounds that the carrying on of the activity to which the licences related was likely to cause a serious threat to public order or public safety.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the committee to decide what weight it wished to attach to the request by the Chief Constable and its relevance to the types of licence held.

Following discussion, the committee agreed to suspend both licences in terms of Paragraph 12(1) of Schedule 1 of the Civic Government (Scotland) Act 1982.

### **PRIVATE HIRE CAR OPERATOR'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL**

**659.** The Committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement) in relation to an application for the renewal of a Private Hire Car Operator's Licence (agenda item 5 refers).

The licensee was present.

Chief Inspector Gallie and Sergeant Campbell, representing the Chief Constable, who had made an out of time objection to the application, were also present.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the Committee to decide if it wished to consider the out of time objection submitted by the Chief Constable and, if so, what weight it wished to attach to the objection and its relevance to the type of licence being applied for.

Having heard the applicant agree that the out of time objection could be considered, the Committee agreed to consider the out of time objection and copies were circulated.

Sergeant Campbell was heard in respect of the objection submitted by the Chief Constable.

The applicant was then heard in respect of the application for renewal.

The Committee agreed to a short adjournment to consider the matter.

On reconvening, the Committee, having taken account of the submission made by the licensee, his previous conviction, its seriousness and relevance to the licence being applied for, and also having taken account of the objection by the Chief Constable, agreed that the application for renewal be refused on the grounds that the licensee was no longer a fit and proper person to be the holder of such a licence by virtue of his previous conviction.

CHAIR



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**EDUCATION COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting, held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on Thursday 9 November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Andrew Anderson (Chair)  
Councillor Kate Campbell  
Councillor Colm Merrick  
Councillor Owen O'Donnell (Leader)  
Councillor Danny Devlin

Councillor Katie Pragnell (Vice Chair)  
Ms Fiona Gilchrist  
Ms Dorothy Graham  
Mr Des Morris  
Ms Evelyn Yedd

Councillor Anderson in the Chair

**Attending:**

Mark Ratter, Director of Education; Janice Collins, Head of Education Services (Performance & Quality Improvement); Joe McCaig, Head of Education Services (Provision); Siobhan McColgan, Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity); Graeme Hay, Senior Manager Leading Change (Education); Colin Sweeney, Democratic Services Manager; John Burke, Committee Services Officer; and Leslyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Alasdair McDonald and Jem Thomson together with pupils from Maidenhill Primary School; and Sara Jenkins with pupils from St Ninian's High School.

**Apology:**

Councillor Gordon Wallace.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**660.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**CHAIR'S WELCOME AND OPENING REMARKS**

**661.** The Chair welcomed all present to the meeting and said it had been excellent to have seen the latest technology set up in the Members' Room prior to the meeting and to also have seen so many pupils and staff there.

## DIGITAL LEARNING AND TEACHING STRATEGY 2024 TO 2027

**662.** The Committee welcomed representatives from Maidenhill Primary School and St. Ninian's High School and invited teachers and pupils to share their experiences of working with digital learning and teaching.

Jem Thomson, Teacher at Maidenhill Primary School, was joined by two primary 7 pupils to show how they innovatively use technology in the school and nursery classes. She advised that the school had access to a wealth of resources and platforms which children used during lessons and lunchtime clubs to develop their skills as part of the digital culture. Support was provided to parents and carers to help them support their learners at home by offering hands on parent workshops at the school. Digital platforms were also used for communication with parents and carers including via twitter and classroom blogs to keep them up to date with what was happening within the learning environment. Pupils provided additional information about their digital experience which included pupils of all ages learning how to code; using chromebooks to code and make games; taking part in a coding day with Morgan Stanely; and using software including Micro:bits, tinkercad and lego education. In addition, a lunchtime girls engineering club had been established to encourage girls to think more about the world of engineering and this included guest speakers, including a software engineer; making code; and learning about 3D printing

Sara Jenkins, Computing Teacher at St. Ninian's High School, referred to the "Dress Code" lunchtime club which had been set up specifically to encourage females into computing and to address the gender gap in computer science. She introduced 3 pupils who were involved with the club to provide more detail about the club and their role in it.

Pupils reported that the club was aimed at S1-3 females to offer a pathway to computing. The club now had over 40 members, with a number of S4-6 pupils attending to mentor younger pupils with a variety of tasks, including programming. Members of the club had been involved in competitions both internally and externally, including a recent contest to devise Halloween themed games. Mentors helped both high school pupils and pupils in local primary schools and had been invited to presentations on a number of subjects including modern and graduate apprenticeship schemes; and taking part in a tour of the new Barclays building. Mentors provided encouragement and advice to younger pupils and the number of female pupils opting to choose computing had increased. They highlighted that computing was not necessarily a solitary pursuit but included group communication, sharing expertise, and developing skills together. Sara Jenkins added that the success of the club was mainly as a result of the enthusiasm and expertise of senior mentors and it wouldn't work the same without them.

Members congratulated both sets of pupils and teachers for providing detailed presentations and further information on the excellent work being carried out in this area in both the primary and secondary sector, as an example of the work being undertaken across schools and nurseries throughout East Renfrewshire, and in particular the work being undertaken to encourage females into the areas of computing and technology.

Thereafter, the Committee considered a report by the Director of Education, providing an update on the evaluation undertaken of the Education Department's previous digital learning and teaching strategy and seeking approval for the new digital learning and teaching strategy 2024 to 2027. The Education Senior Manager (Leading Change) highlighted the evaluation undertaken of the previous strategy, which had been extended as a result of the pandemic, noting that consultation with stakeholders had been central to the development of the new strategy. He went on to outline the vision of the new digital learning and teaching strategy,

based around three key aims: digital access; digital learning and teaching; and digital leadership, with associated activities for each.

The Education Senior Manager further highlighted that the strategy could not be viewed in isolation and it was important that it was viewed both within the context of the wider work of the Education Department, as well as work across the Council, specifically noting the importance of partnership working with the Council's IT Service to deliver on these ambitions. Thereafter, he highlighted that there had been a formatting error in the strategy advising that within the digital access theme, the final line should read: "Promote and facilitate inclusion and accessibility for all learners and their families, particularly those who are at risk of educational disadvantage and those who have additional learning needs.", and this would be amended for the final published version of the strategy.

Councillor Buchanan welcomed the strategy indicating that digital provision was part of the future of education to ensure that pupils and teaching staff had the right skills and supports to move forward in this area. However, he added that there could be some negative impacts of technology, including in relation to Artificial Intelligence which would require to be closely regulated.

Councillor O'Donnell advised that he had a number of concerns in relation to the strategy, which he had discussed separately with the Director of Education and other officers prior to the meeting, highlighting that there was a need for a clearer rationale within the strategy to explain why this work was being taken forward and the expected impact on pupil and staff outcomes and wellbeing. He added that there should also be clearer information on the provision of digital devices to those experiencing social exclusion.

In response, the Education Senior Manager agreed to submit a follow up report to a future Education Committee meeting specifically seeking to be more explicit in the links between the digital learning and teaching strategy and the wider work of the department. In addition, it was agreed to consider the expected impacts on pupil outcomes through consideration of the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).

Mr Morris highlighted the impact of technology on teaching staff, particularly in relation to workload, and how this would be linked with the wider education reform which was ongoing, and it was acknowledged that this was an area which would require further work in due course when the outcome of education reforms was known.

The Director of Education confirmed that continuous improvement was always a part of the Education Department's approach but he accepted that more work required to be done to highlight how this strategy would impact on both pupil and teacher outcomes and wellbeing. He advised that this could be achieved through regular Standards and Quality reports; regular inspections; and internal reviews, amongst other things. However, he advised that he would be reluctant to directly link the use of technology with attainment targets. He added that the presentations provided today illustrated some of the ways in which the gender gap for learning was being targeted within schools.

In response to a question from Councillor Anderson on the connectivity infrastructure within educational establishments, the Director of Education advised that he worked closely with colleagues in Business Operations and Partnerships in this regard and that this type of issue was reviewed regularly through reports submitted to Cabinet and Council as part of the transformation programme.

The committee agreed to:-

676

- (a) note the evaluation undertaken on the department's previous digital learning and teaching strategy;
- (b) approve the new draft digital learning and teaching strategy for 2024-27; and
- (c) request the Director of Education to report to the Education Committee on the impact of its implementation, including in relation to the links between the digital learning and teaching strategy and the wider work of the department; and to consider the expected impacts on pupil outcomes through consideration of the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs); and
- (d) otherwise, note the report, presentations and associated comments.

### **PERFORMANCE 2022-2023 – PRESENTATION**

**663.** Councillor Anderson invited the Head of Education Services (Performance and Quality Improvement) to give a presentation on the performance of East Renfrewshire Schools in the broad general education and senior phase. It was reported that the information presented would include information from primary establishments, junior phase secondary data, as well as senior phase data relating to SQA awards.

She reported that there had been improvements in reading, writing, talking & listening, and mathematics attainment throughout the years of the Broad General Education when compared to 2021-22. 91% of Primary 1, 4 and 7 pupils were achieving expected levels or better for reading, 90% for writing, 94% in talking and listening, and 91% in maths. It was highlighted that there had been a 2% increase for all pupils in reading achievement with children resident in SIMD 1 and 2 areas remaining the same as last year. She highlighted that there was a need to focus efforts on helping those most in need to ensure that the equity gap could be bridged. However, SIMD 1 and 2 children achieving the expected level in numeracy had increased by 1% since 2021-22, which was the same increase as the overall figure. It was reported that the gender gap had decreased for both literacy and numeracy since 2021-22. Figures for pupils in S3 in relation to reading, writing, and talking & listening, showed that numbers had remained static or had improved in relation to overall figures and for those within SIMD 1 and 2, and the gender gap had also reduced. However, it was highlighted that the overall numeracy figure had reduced by 2%.

Thereafter, further detail was provided on improvements in the senior phase. Focussing on the S4 cohort, she reported that around 7% of the cohort were registered for free school meals; 23% identified as an ethnic minority; and the number of young people living in quintile 1 had slightly reduced when compared to last year's S4 cohort. Information was provided on the number of pupils in S4 who sat National 5 exams, and the pass rates awarded. Overall, the authority's pass rate had improved with Williamwood, Woodfarm and St. Luke's High Schools recording increases. It was further reported that, when comparing awards of 5 or more at SQA level 5 or better, all schools in East Renfrewshire had outperformed their virtual comparator, and this was also the case for awards of 5 or more at SQA level 6 or better for S5 pupils. In relation to pupils in S6 achieving 1 or more awards at SQA level 7, the virtual comparator was outperformed for most schools. Information was also provided on the quality of awards achieved showing that, not only had the number of S4 pupils achieving 8 or more Nat 5 awards increased to 59.5%, but the number of pupils achieving 8 or more A awards had also increased to 28%. She added that pupils were being well supported at both home and school to achieve these increases.

Further information was provided on the use of Insight tariff points which could assist with identifying gaps between different groups of pupils. Insight point information was provided by SIMD for the most deprived 30%, middle 40% and least deprived 30% of pupils, which showed that, although the figures had dipped slightly for pupils from the most deprived areas when compared to the years when pupils did not sit a formal exam, the figures had in fact increased for all groups when compared to those achieved prior to the pandemic in 2019. These figures had led to a national debate on the best way to measure attainment in the senior phase and the data provided would be used to inform future consultations in that regard.

Leaver attainment information across literacy and numeracy was provided for the last 5 years showing that literacy and numeracy at levels 4, 5 and 6 had generally stayed the same or had slightly increased. In terms of leaver destinations, figures showed that the percentage of leavers in a positive destination had increased for all leavers, but particularly for those leavers in quintile 1 which had increased by 6% since 2018.

Improvement case studies were provided, including in relation to a project on Improving Literacy through Reading Recovery. Two principal teachers of literacy had been appointed to lead reading recovery in the authority and to support staff in all schools to target pupils, usually in Primary 2, who required additional support in this area. 61 pupils across 8 schools had worked with the reading recovery teachers and all pupils involved had improved their reading skills.

Thereafter, an improvement case study was provided for Woodfarm High School. At Woodfarm High School universal support was provided for all senior phase pupils and included shared ethos of ambition for all; whole school assessment calendar to balance workload for pupils throughout the year; access to study skills sessions; supported study and Easter school; use of industry partners and alumni where possible; and relentless level of effort from all stakeholders. Targeted support was also provided through a new mentoring programme for S4, S5, and S6 pupils; narrowing the gap through robust interventions for key equity groups; creative and bespoke curriculum for pupils where appropriate; provision of free stationery and study materials to remove barriers; individualised target setting and personalised study timetables where appropriate; and family learning programme for parents and carers.

Ms Graham welcomed the information provided, adding that the impact of lockdown should not be underestimated for the current S4 and S5 pupils in relation to their skills development and socialisation and the impact on their mental health. She added that it was a great tribute to the young people, teachers and families that they had achieved as much as they had considering what they had gone through in the past few years.

Thereafter, a number of members thanked the Head of Education Services (Performance and Quality Improvement) for a very informative presentation and requested that any future presentation on this subject be provided to members in advance of the meeting, if possible, to allow additional preparations to be made. Having heard Councillor Pragnell welcome the additional data on attendance which was due to be provided in February 2024, Councillor O'Donnell sought additional information in relation to the gender gap in general; attainment gaps in primary schools which remained stubborn; and the possibility of increasing targets in some areas as they had already been achieved this year. In response, the Head of Education Services (Performance and Quality Improvement) advised that individual schools were supported to look at different ways to address imbalances, including in relating to gender gaps, and this work would continue on that basis as each school had different needs. She advised that literacy and numeracy support in the primary sector had been included as part of the Strategic Equity Plan report considered at the last Education Committee meeting. This plan included 3 workstreams, which would be submitted to the Education Committee separately in due course to allow each area to be considered in more detail. In relation to achievement

678

targets, she advised that the targets had been shared with schools and wouldn't necessarily be amended at this stage. However, she added that, where schools had already achieved their targets, they could push beyond the targets which had been set as there was no upper limit.

Having heard Members commend the work of pupils, teachers and staff in producing such excellent results, the committee noted the presentation and associated comments.

CHAIR



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**AUDIT & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 23 November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Andrew Morrison (Chair)\*  
Councillor Tony Buchanan (Vice Chair)\*  
Councillor Paul Edlin

Provost Mary Montague\*  
Councillor David Macdonald\*  
Councillor Gordon Wallace

Councillor Morrison in the Chair

(\*) indicates remote attendance

**Attending:**

Mark Ratter, Director of Education; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Janice Collins, Head of Education Services (Performance & Quality Improvement); Gillian McCarney, Head of Place; Barbara Clark, Chief Accountant; Michelle Blair, Chief Auditor; Michelle McGuckin, Principal Officer, Capital Projects; Linda Hutchison, Clerk to the Committee; and Lesleyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Grace Scanlin, Ernst and Young.

**Apology:**

Councillor Annette Ireland.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**664.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**CHAIR'S REPORT**

**665.** Councillor Morrison reported that he had very recently attended helpful and important *Cyber Resilience and Risk Training for Public Sector Board Members* organised by The Scottish Government Cyber Resilience Unit at which the importance of creating an effective cyber security culture; safeguarding organisations; assessing cyber risk exposure; identifying

680

critical data and systems; responding to cyber incidents; and action planning had been commented on.

The Committee noted the position.

### **CLARIFICATION RECEIVED ON QUERIES RAISED AT PREVIOUS MEETING**

**666.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 26 September 2023 (Page 639, Item 593 refers) when it had been agreed to seek comments from appropriate officers on various issues, the Committee considered a report by the Clerk summarising the clarification received and circulated on queries raised regarding the 2022/23 Annual Accounts. Specifically feedback had been provided on when unspent COVID grants would be spent, and why Council income, as shown in the Comprehensive Income and Expenditure Statement, had substantially reduced in relation to the Health and Social Care Partnership (HSCP).

The Committee noted the position.

### **INTERIM TREASURY MANAGEMENT REPORT 2023/24 – QUARTER 2**

**667.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 26 September 2023 (Page 642, Item 596 refers), when it had been agreed to note the Interim Treasury Management Report for Quarter 1 of 2023/24 and recommend to the Council that the organisations specified in the report for investment of surplus funds be approved, the Committee considered a report by the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) on treasury management activities for the second Quarter of 2023/24.

The report explained that, in line with the CIPFA Code of Practice on Treasury Management, the Committee was responsible for ensuring effective inspection of the Council's treasury management activities. In accordance with that requirement, the interim Treasury Management Report for July to September 2023 was attached to the report for consideration.

Whilst highlighting key aspects of the report, the Chief Accountant confirmed that long term borrowing was static, with none having been taken due to the high levels of rates currently offered, resulting in an increase in internal borrowing. The Council continued to adopt a prudent approach to treasury management and, in particular, the percentage of loans held as of 30 September 2023 with variable interest rates was just over 7% which was well below the Council's approved upper limit of 15%.

Having commented on short term investments which had increased due to cash flows in both capital and revenue, the Chief Accountant highlighted the prudential indicators referred to in the report which helped confirm that capital investment plans and treasury management decisions remained affordable, prudent and sustainable. She highlighted that indicators 3 and 4 demonstrated that the Council was operating well within its limits.

Finally, the Chief Accountant commented on the Council's list of counterparties, confirming it had not changed from the one in the Treasury Management Report for Quarter 1. It was clarified that all investments were restricted to UK bodies with high credit ratings, with the maximum period of investment, in general, restricted to 6 months.

In response to Councillor Wallace, the Chief Accountant confirmed that the Council only pursued long term borrowing at fixed rates, such as from the Public Works Loan Board. In response to Councillor Morrison who referred to ethical issues relating to borrowing raised at the full Council meeting in October, the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer)

confirmed that the surplus funds referred to in the report were not targeted at a particular sector in terms of investment, but rather deposited securely with major financial institutions on a short term basis of up to 6 months, taking account of regularly updated advice provided by the Council's treasury management advisors. She added that keeping the investment decisions made by those institutions under ongoing review was not feasible, but that the approach taken was amended as required on the basis of the advice provided, this being why the Council was asked to approve the list of counterparties quarterly.

In response to an issue raised by Councillor Macdonald, it was highlighted by Councillor Morrison that the scrutiny of investment decisions made by Strathclyde Pension Fund (SPF) fell out with the remit of the Committee, but that he was free to request feedback from SPF on this.

The Committee agreed:-

- (a) to **recommend to the Council** that the organisations for investment of surplus funds be approved in accordance with Appendix 8 to the report; and
- (b) otherwise, to note the report and related comments made.

## **NATIONAL EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORT – EARLY LEARNING AND CHILDCARE - PROGRESS DELIVERING THE 1140 HOURS EXPANSION**

**668.** The Committee considered a report by the Clerk on the publication in June 2023 of a report by Audit Scotland entitled *Early Learning and Childcare - Progress Delivering the 1140 Hours Expansion*. Under the Committee's specialisation arrangements, Councillor Wallace was leading the review of the report. The Director of Education had been asked to provide comments and a copy of the feedback provided was appended to the report.

Having referred to various Audit Scotland reports published over time on early learning and childcare (ELC), the report confirmed that the most recent one commented not only on progress delivering the ELC expansion to 1140 hours, but also planning for the assessment of the impact of the expansion. The ELC expansion had already been the subject of various reports submitted to the Education Committee.

The report itemised the key messages in the Audit Scotland report, commenting on their pertinence to local authorities in general and East Renfrewshire in particular. Reference was made to work progressed locally on the expansion despite the Scottish Government changing the timescale from August 2020 to August 2021 for placing a statutory duty on education authorities to make 1140 hours of ELC available to each eligible child. By August 2021, children in East Renfrewshire had been receiving the additional element of the 1140 hours for one year.

Details were provided on the take up of the provision and position in particular schools; satisfaction with the provision locally; the identification of those eligible to receive ELC and related issues; partnership working to promote the entitlement; and the allocation of places. The flexibility on offer to parents; rates of deferral applications; the evaluation of the provision and related consultation; and the Education Department's full adherence to the *Funding Follows the Child* policy and related issues were amongst others issues referred to.

Support for those delivering the provision was also commented on, including how investment in career long professional learning was mitigating against some of the challenges, and how support was provided to staff to develop the skills and knowledge they required to work in early years. Other issues commented on included the quality of the ELC provision; the positive findings of external inspections in East Renfrewshire by Education Scotland and the Care

Inspectorate; the extent to which the quality of ELC locally exceeded National Standard requirements; and performance relative to the Local Government Benchmarking Framework. Financial issues were also referred to, including continued uncertainty around future funding for ELC. The position was also summarised on the adoption locally, with effect from August 2023, of the national position regarding ELC entitlement from a child's third birthday; digital improvements to the application process; and the commissioning of places from funded providers.

Having commented on aims of research commissioned as part of the West Partnership (Glasgow Regional Education Improvement Collaborative) on the impact of the 1140 hours of ELC, evaluation to be done at a national level, and the tracking of children's development and attainment throughout their nursery experience, the report concluded that the Education Department was well placed to address recommendations made in the Audit Scotland report, which would be overtaken as the Department continued to strive to improve ELC and the implementation of 1140 hours for all eligible children.

Councillor Wallace welcomed the opportunity for the Committee to hear about the provision, highlighting the progress made before it required to be, the fragility of the sector in terms of staff recruitment and retention, and ongoing uncertainty regarding future funding.

The Head of Education Services (Performance & Quality Improvement) highlighted key aspects of the report, including how the expansion had contributed to helping children who had been isolated during the COVID lockdowns. Having referred to annual updates on progress submitted to the Education Committee, she referred to the level of take up of the provision, its evaluation, the benefit of being able to recruit staff at an early stage given the local timescales adopted to develop the provision, and the importance of ongoing continuing professional development for those working in the sector to build capacity and resilience. She welcomed the positive external evaluations of the provision in East Renfrewshire, the commitment of partners, and longitudinal work being done to assess the impact of the provision.

In response to Councillor Wallace, the Director of Education provided additional clarification on various issues including funding, such as the initial tapered funding model, the need for efficiency and Best Value, and importance of having sufficient ELC staff on an ongoing basis. He highlighted that funding remained an issue which required models of provision to be kept under review, clarity to be sought from the Scottish Government when needed, and discussions to be held locally in the context of the development of the Council's budget. The full impact of the position on deferrals needed to be considered, with it being expected that pressure on provision would increase from this.

Councillor Buchanan welcomed the timescale adopted locally for the 1140 hours expansion and high quality of the provision which gave children the best start in life, adding that the financial position remained difficult.

In response to Councillor Morrison who asked about the adequacy of ELC capacity locally, the Director of Education confirmed that models of provision were reviewed, citing examples of when this had been done. Capacity of the school and early year estate was also kept under review constantly, including in the context of demographic projections such as the birth rate which was expected to fall. This had started to be reflected in the number of children attending primary school.

The Committee noted the report and additional information and clarification provided at the meeting.

## **NATIONAL EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORT - SCOTLAND'S CITY REGION AND GROWTH DEALS – PROGRESS ON 2020 AUDIT REPORT**

**669.** The Committee considered a report by the Clerk on the publication in June 2023 of a report by Audit Scotland entitled *Scotland's City Region and Growth Deals – Progress On 2020 Audit Report*. Under the Committee's specialisation arrangements, Councillor Ireland was leading the review of the report. The Director of Environment had been asked to provide comments and a copy of the feedback provided was appended to the report.

The report confirmed that the main governance body for the initiative locally was the Glasgow City Region – City Deal Cabinet, the Leader of the Council being the Council's representative on it. It was clarified that the Glasgow City Region Project Management Office had submitted information to Audit Scotland to inform the preparation of the national report, following which progress nationally on City Deal issues was referred to. A report on the Audit Scotland report submitted to the City Deal Cabinet in August had noted good progress made against the 2020 recommendations, and that governance, scrutiny and risk management arrangements had been strengthened locally and nationally. An update on the City Deal Programme in relation to East Renfrewshire had been presented to the Council's Cabinet in March 2023, information on which was provided.

Councillor Morrison commented that the report submitted to the Council's Cabinet was some months old. In response to a query from him regarding the new railway station at Barrhead, the Principal Officer, Capital Projects provided an update on the project, referring to discussions with Network Rail and Transport Scotland and confirming that it was anticipated that the final business case would be submitted to the Glasgow City Region Chief Executives' Group in May or June 2024 for approval. In response to a further request from him for an update on the Aurs Road realignment project, the Principal Officer, Capital Projects referred to issues raised by partners, reporting that final details regarding the contract were being tied up, and that it was anticipated that work on site would commence in January 2024.

Councillor Buchanan referred to frustrations regarding delays to the work on the railway station such as arising from issues partner organisations had raised, welcoming the progress reported despite the fact that the associated costs had now risen due to the delays and the pandemic. Regarding the Aurs Road realignment project, he acknowledged there would be short term travel issues while the work was done, but highlighted the longer term benefits of it.

The Committee, having also heard Councillor Morrison welcome the progress reported, noted the report and additional information and clarification provided at the meeting.

## **INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN 2023/24 – IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS – JULY TO SEPTEMBER 2023**

**670.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 30 March 2023 (Page 459, Item 391 refers) when the Internal Audit Strategic Plan for 2023/24 to 2027/28 had been approved, the Committee considered a report by the Chief Auditor advising of progress on the Internal Audit Annual Plan 2023/24 from 1 July to 30 September 2023. It was confirmed that one audit report in relation to planned 2023/24 audit work had been completed in Quarter 2, information on which had been provided and regarding which a satisfactory management response had been received.

Reference was also made to the quarterly performance indicators (PIs) for the section, and one new request for assistance dealt with using contingency time which related to assisting another service in sourcing information. In addition, some assistance had been given to

another service to help automate some processes to reduce time taken to carry out a task and reduce the risk of human error.

The Chief Auditor referred to key aspects of the report. Regarding audit work done on Debtors Control, she highlighted the two main areas of concern, the first being the level of outstanding payroll debt, not only in relation to accounts being raised for leavers, but also existing employees. She confirmed that further details on this issue would be provided in a future progress report when the Payroll Audit report was finalised. Secondly she reported that lists of users on Integra were not being updated promptly for leavers. Common to both of these issues was that they were primarily caused by managers not taking the actions expected of them promptly, such as notifying payroll and system administrators of leavers.

Regarding the Debtors Control audit, having highlighted that the deadline for implementation of a number of the actions had passed and that the remaining ones were scheduled to be completed by the end of December, Councillor Morrison, supported by other Elected Members, proposed that updates on implementation of the actions be sought for submission to the Committee by the end of February 2024. Having heard Councillor Wallace express concern that procedures were not being adhered to, Councillor Morrison referred to the importance of identifying the root cause of this and highlighted the risk of leavers having potential access to accounts and systems when they should not. He added that this was an example of the type of issue raised at the training session he had attended on *Cyber Resilience and Risk for Public Sector Board Members*. In response to a further issue raised by him, the Chief Auditor stated that it was hard to confirm if any type of automation or Artificial Intelligence (AI) could deliver improvement, that it was not easy to identify the exact person to contact about access to various systems, and that there was a leavers checklist that should be completed by managers whenever an employee left. The Chief Auditor confirmed that follow-up work by Internal Audit on the implementation of the actions agreed in relation to the Debtors Control audit would be done in due course.

Councillor Morrison asked if working from home had resulted in it becoming less apparent when someone left the Council. Having heard the Chief Auditor confirm that this had not been a focus of the audit, the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) expressed the view that this should not be a factor as employees only worked a proportion of their time from home. Councillor Wallace suggested that working from home could have led to cultural changes within the organisation, following which Provost Montague expressed the view that those working from home could be more industrious due to there being less interruptions for example. Having heard Councillor Macdonald agree with comments made by both Councillor Wallace and Provost Montague, it was proposed that a report be sought on the advantages and disadvantages of working from home, drawing on local experience and the findings of research on this issue at a more national level.

Further in response to Councillor Wallace who raised the vacancies within the Internal Audit section which had been ongoing for an extended period, and argued that the assistance she had had to provide to other services had been detrimental to the section, the Chief Auditor confirmed that the vacancies remained, and that an advert to recruit had set a deadline for applications of 7 January. She stated that she could provide an update in due course, expressing hope that the recruitment exercise would be successful.

The Committee agreed:-

- (a) to seek feedback from appropriate officers on the implementation of the recommendations within the Internal Audit Report on Debtor Control for submission to the Committee by the end of February at the latest;

- (b) that the Chief Auditor should provide an update at a future meeting on progress filling the vacancies within the Internal Audit section;
- (c) that the HR Manager should submit a report to a future meeting on the advantages and disadvantages of working from home, drawing on local experience and the findings of research on this issue at a more national level;
- (d) not to seek any of the reports issued during the quarter at this stage; and
- (e) otherwise, to note the report and related comments made.

CHAIR





**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 29<sup>th</sup> November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Betty Cunningham (Chair)	Councillor Paul Edlin
Councillor Jim McLean (Vice Chair)(*)	Councillor Chris Lunday(*)

Councillor Cunningham in the Chair

**Attending:**

Gillian McCarney, Head of Place; Julie Nicol, Planning and Building Standards Manager (\*); Alan Pepler, Principal Planner (Development Management); John Burke, Committee Services Officer; Lesleyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

(\*) indicates remote attendance

**Apologies:**

Provost Mary Montague, Councillors Annette Ireland and Andrew Morrison.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**SECTION 33A NOTICE – 29 EAST KILBRIDE ROAD, BUSBY, G76 8JY - UPDATE**

**671.** The Committee considered a report by the Director of Environment on the service of a Notice under Section 33A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997, authorised by the Planning Applications Committee on 7 June 2023 (Page 531, Item 470 refers), in respect of unauthorised development at 29 East Kilbride Road, Busby, G76 8JY.

At the outset of the item's consideration, Councillor McLean, seconded by Councillor Cunningham, moved that, to facilitate proper consideration of this item, the matter be deferred to allow for a site visit to be arranged and carried out.

The Committee approved the motion and the item was deferred to a future meeting to allow a site visit to take place.

## **PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING SCHEDULE**

**672.** The Committee considered a report by the Director of Environment on the impact of a reduced frequency of Planning Applications Committee meetings held during 2023 and to consider arrangements for 2024.

The report indicated that the reduced Planning Applications Committee meeting schedule had not impacted on performance and, therefore, it proposed that the current arrangements would continue.

The Committee agreed to continue to hold Planning Applications Committee meetings bi-monthly (every second month) during 2024 and to review the effectiveness of this arrangement in June 2024.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**  
**(POLICE & FIRE)**

**Minute of meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 30 November 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Owen O'Donnell (Leader)	Councillor Katie Pragnell
Councillor Andrew Anderson (Vice Chair)	Councillor Gordon Wallace(*)

Councillor O'Donnell in the Chair

**Attending:**

Louise Pringle, Director of Business Operations and Partnerships; Stephen Bell, Community Safety Manager; John Burke, Committee Services Officer; and Lesleyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Superintendent Natalie Carr; Chief Inspector Graeme Gallie, (Area Commander), Police Scotland; Area Commander David McCarrey; and Group Commander Alan Coughtrie, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service.

**Apology:**

Councillor Caroline Bamforth

**CHAIR'S REMARKS**

**673.** The Chair welcomed Superintendent Natalie Carr to her first meeting of the Cabinet (Police and Fire).

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**674.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**POLICE SCOTLAND – PERFORMANCE REPORT - QUARTER 2 - 2023-24**

**675.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Divisional Commander, Police Scotland, providing details of the performance of the police over the second quarter of 2023-24. The

report also provided statistical information in relation to various categories of crimes and offences committed during the reported period together with comparative statistics for the corresponding period in 2022-23.

Introducing the report, Superintendent Carr first thanked the Chair and the Committee, as well as all Police partner organisations, for their contributions to the collaborative approach that had led to the excellent statistics outlined in the report. She expressed her wish that this partnership approach would continue.

Chief Inspector Gallie then reported on the performance of the police against the five local policing priorities contained in the East Renfrewshire Policing Plan 2023-26.

On referring to the report, he recognised the significant impact acquisitive crime and in particular theft by housebreaking, had on communities and was pleased to report a significant decrease in that area. He advised that there had been 37 offences during the year, which was 53% below the 5 year average for the period, with the detection rate for the offences up 7%.

In respect of crimes of dishonesty, it was reported that crimes of this type had decreased by 4% for the year. Theft by shoplifting continued to climb with 120 offences compared to 97 the previous year. It was believed that the cost of living crisis was having an effect on these figures. It was also highlighted that Police Scotland had seen a significant success in recovering funds for victims of Fraud, with £100,000 of funds recorded during the quarter for complainers who had been subject to online and banking fraud.

In relation to public protection, it was noted that there had been a 12% reduction in overall recordings of sexual crimes and offences, but noted that offences of communicating indecently and threatening/disclosure of intimate images had seen an increase. Police Scotland continued to work in partnership with Education colleagues and others to highlight the risk and harm of sextortion and inappropriate communications through social media messaging and Campus Officer inputs.

Commenting on violent crime, Chief Inspector Gallie reported an increase in Non-Sexual Crimes of Violence, with 11 offences recorded during the quarter, bringing the total to 46 for the year. No serious assaults had been reported during the quarter.

In terms of antisocial behaviour and disorder, 953 complaints had been recorded by the end of the quarter, which was 2% lower than the same period in the previous year. Hate crimes and hate incidents were also reported to have decreased against both the previous year and the 3 year average.

It was highlighted that a significant focus continued on wilful fire raisings, with 25 having been reported in the year. A whole systems approach was being taken to addressing the issues around these incidents, working with partners in a trauma informed approach to young people and their families.

In relation to drug dealing and use it was noted that recorded drug crimes had increased by 13% from the previous year, which had been achieved through active policing and intelligence gathering, with 8 offences of supply detected.

Chief Inspector Gallie concluded by giving some examples of the work being done in East Renfrewshire by officers of Police Scotland on all of the areas of focus covered, which were highlighted within the report.

There followed a question and answer session in the course of which Chief Inspector Gallie responded to a number of questions and provided clarification on a range of operational issues within East Renfrewshire and the crime statistics recorded in the report. In particular, there was discussion of the work of Campus Officers and the whole systems approach taken, in particular, in relation to shoplifting where the cost of living crisis could be having an impact.

The Cabinet noted the report.

## **SCOTTISH FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE (SFRS) PERFORMANCE REPORT FOR THE SECOND QUARTER OF 2023-24**

**676.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Group Commander, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (SFRS), providing details of the performance of SFRS in East Renfrewshire during the first quarter of 2023-24 against the key priorities in their local plan.

Introducing the report, Area Commander McCarrey referred to the work over bonfire night and extended his thanks to all partners who had been involved. He also praised the work of young people who had participated in the Fire Skills event and thanked partners for their engagement in turning out for the passing out parade for participants. Finally, he mentioned that His Majesty's Fire Service Inspectorate for Scotland had visited and spoken with both SFRS and Police Scotland.

Group Commander Coughtrie then reported on the performance of SFRS on performance over quarter 2.

Group Commander Coughtrie began by discussing the role of the SFRS Community Safety Enforcement Department, who supported duty holders in local businesses to ensure they were meeting statutory regulations and reduce non-domestic fires in East Renfrewshire. He provided details of how they audited properties to establish levels of risk and interventions that may be required.

Group Commander Coughtrie continued by thanking East Renfrewshire Council for their collaborative efforts on the Unwanted Fire Alarm Signals (UFAS) Policy changes and the Short-Term Letting Policy. He also thanked the Council, Police Scotland and the Scottish Ambulance Service for working with SFRS on the recent Fire Skills course, which had been a great success. He indicated that another such event was planned to be run in March 2024.

On engagement activity that had taken place and equipment supplied during the quarter, 33 community activities by the community action team and 82 by operational crews. 223 home fires safety visits were carried out, 98 in premises identified as high risk with 117 smoke detectors being fitted.

In relation to accidental dwelling fires a 10% decrease on the year on year figure was reported and a 17% reduction against the 3 year figure. It was noted that detection was present in 89% of premises and activated in 75%. Details of some of the ongoing community work that took place was provided, with the high engagement rates in East Renfrewshire being noted. There had been 1 fire related casualty, with an individual requiring first aid at the scene and no hospital treatment required. The Post-Domestic Incident Response Programme was also highlighted.

Group Commander Coughtrie reported that the figures in relation to unintentional injury and harm saw a 33% increase in the year-on-year average and an increase of 25% against 3

692

year average figures. However it was clarified this was against a figure of no casualties for the previous 3 years.

Deliberate fire setting showed an 8% increase on the year on year indicator, with a 3% increase on the 3 year average. Again, this was reported as being against historically low figures. The Community Action Team and Operational Crews continued to carry out engagement activity to mitigate the risk of this type of activity, working in partnership with Police Scotland and other partners. It was indicated that certain groups had been identified and it was expected that a significant drop would be achieved in the next quarter.

Non-domestic fire safety showed a 60% decrease from the previous year and stable figure against the 3 year average. Details of the incidents were provided.

Group Commander Coughtrie concluded by providing information in relation to UFAS. The year on year figure had decreased by 77%, a decrease of 16% on the 3 year average. It was indicated that the decrease in UFAS was particularly pleasing and showed the success of recent policy changes.

There followed a question and answer session in the course of which officers McCarrey and Coughtrie responded to a number of questions and comments on a range of issues recorded in the report. Mainly, the discussion focused on the number of deliberate fire setting incidents and the response by East Renfrewshire based teams to fires outside of the East Renfrewshire area. Improvements in UFAS figures were also welcomed.

Area Commander McCarrey offered members the opportunity to participate in a future session where they could view the Virtual Reality tool used by Fire Officers in relation to vehicle safety. It was also agreed that SFRS would review their presentation of figures, in liaison with elected members, to ensure they were easily understood.

Thereafter the Cabinet agreed to note the report.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LICENSING COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock, on 5 December 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Paul Edlin (Chair)  
Provost Mary Montague\*

Councillor David Macdonald\*

Councillor Edlin in the Chair

(\*) indicates remote attendance

**Attending:**

Gerry Mahon, Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement); Brian Kilpatrick, Civic Government Enforcement Officer; Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer; and Lesleyann Burns, Assistant Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Chief Inspector Graeme Gallie and Sergeant Lisa Campbell, Police Scotland.

**Apology:**

Councillor Andrew Morrison.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**677.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE VEHICLE POLICY**

**678.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement) seeing approval to commence a consultation with the trade, public and relevant disability rights groups to provide information to inform potential changes to the Council's current Wheelchair Accessible Vehicle Policy. (Item 3 refers).

The report explained that, as a result of the financial impacts of the Covid pandemic upon members of the taxi trade, the Licensing Committee had agreed to changes to the previous Wheelchair Accessible Vehicle Policy with effect from April 2021. From that date, only taxi car applications would require to meet the Wheelchair Accessible Vehicle (WAV) criteria.

The Chief Officer (Legal & Procurement) advised that only 5 WAVs were currently licensed in East Renfrewshire, a drop from 41 prior to April 2021, and that a review of the policy would be required to review its effectiveness and decide what changes, if any, should be implemented.

In response to questions from members, the Chief Officer (Legal & Procurement) confirmed that all of the WAVs currently licenced in the area were able to accommodate a wheelchair within the vehicle; and that the consultation would be advertised widely, in liaison with the Council's Communications Team, and would include, but not be restricted to, contact with taxi/private hire groups, local and possibly national disability groups, community councils and the general public.

The committee agreed to authorise the Clerk to:-

- (a) commence consultation with relevant stakeholders to ingather information regarding the current availability of wheelchair accessible vehicles to the public and the demand for such vehicles;
- (b) undertake an Equalities Impact Assessment to inform any future changes to the policy; and
- (c) bring a further report to committee in early 2024 with proposals as to any recommended changes to the policy.

### **Resolution to Exclude Press and Public**

At this point in the meeting, on the motion of the Chair, the Committee unanimously resolved that in accordance with the provisions of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the remaining items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraphs 6 and 14 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A to the Act.

### **PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL**

**679.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 7 November 2023 (Page 671, Item 659 refers), when it was agreed that the application for renewal of a Private Car Hire Operator's Licence be refused, the committee considered a report by the Chief Officer – Legal and Procurement in relation to an application for the renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (Agenda Item 3 refers).

The licensee, having been invited to the meeting, was not present.

Chief Inspector Gallie and Sergeant Campbell, representing the Chief Constable, who had made an objection in respect of the application, were present.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the committee to decide what weight it wished to attach to the objection by the Chief Constable.

Sergeant Campbell was heard in respect of the objection by the Chief Constable and in response to questions from Members.



The committee, having taken account of the licensee's previous conviction, its seriousness and relevance to the licence being applied for, and also having taken account of the objection by the Chief Constable, agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the licensee was no longer a fit and proper person to be the holder of such a licence by virtue of his previous conviction.

#### **PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL**

**680.** The Committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement) in relation to an application for the renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (agenda item 5 refers).

The licensee was present together with his friend who acted as an interpreter.

Chief Inspector Gallie and Sergeant Campbell, representing the Chief Constable, who had made an out of time objection to the application, were also present.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the Committee to decide if it wished to consider the out of time objection submitted by the Chief Constable and, if so, what weight it wished to attach to the objection and its relevance to the type of licence being applied for.

Following discussion, the Committee agreed to consider the out of time objection and copies were circulated.

Sergeant Campbell was heard in respect of the objection submitted by the Chief Constable and in response to questions from members.

The licensee did not make any comment.

The Committee agreed to a short adjournment to consider the matter.

On reconvening, the Committee, having taken account of the objection by the Chief Constable, agreed that the application for renewal be continued until after the date of the pending court case.

#### **PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR GRANT**

**681.** The Committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal and Procurement) in relation to an application for the grant of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (agenda item 6 refers).

The applicant, having been invited to the meeting, was not present.

Chief Inspector Gallie and Sergeant Campbell, representing the Chief Constable, who had made an out of time objection to the application, were present.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the Committee to decide if it wished to consider the out of time objection submitted by the Chief Constable and, if so, what weight it wished to attach to the objection and its relevance to the type of licence being applied for.

Following discussion, the Committee agreed to consider the out of time objection and copies were circulated.

Sergeant Campbell was heard in respect of the objection submitted by the Chief Constable and in response to questions from members.

696

The Committee agreed to a short adjournment to consider the matter.

On reconvening, the Committee, having taken account of the applicant's previous conviction, its seriousness and relevance to the licence being applied for, and also having taken account of the objection by the Chief Constable, agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the applicant was not a fit and proper person to be the holder of such a licence by virtue of his previous conviction.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**APPEALS COMMITTEE**

**Minute of meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 7 December 2023.**

**Present:**

Councillor Andrew Anderson (Chair)  
Councillor Colm Merrick

Councillor Katie Pragnell  
Councillor Gordon Wallace

Councillor Anderson in the Chair

**Attending:**

Geri Taylor, HR Business Partner; Gerry Mahon, Chief Officer – Legal and Procurement; John Burke, Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillor Danny Devlin.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**682.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**Resolution to Exclude Press and Public**

At this point in the meeting, on the motion of the Chair, the committee unanimously resolved that in accordance with the provisions of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A to the Act.

**APPEAL AGAINST DISMISSAL – HSCP – 04/2023**

**683.** Gayle Smart, Senior Manager – Unscheduled Care and Intensive Services and Cheryl Silvester, Senior HR Officer appeared on behalf of management.

The appellant appeared in connection with the appeal.

Both parties made their submissions to the committee and were heard in answer to questions on their submissions.

698

Thereafter both parties withdrew from the meeting.

Following consideration, both parties were recalled and advised by the Chair that the grounds of the appeal had not been substantiated and the appeal was not upheld.

CHAIR